



PROJECT MUSE®

---

Banned Emotions: Figuring the Feelings of Unwanted People

Laura Otis

Configurations, Volume 24, Number 3, Summer 2016, pp. 303-329 (Article)

Published by Johns Hopkins University Press

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/con.2016.0020>



➔ *For additional information about this article*

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/629656>

---

## Banned Emotions: Figuring the Feelings of Unwanted People

**Laura Otis**  
**Emory University**

**ABSTRACT:** Metaphors for culturally “banned” emotions such as prolonged anger reveal what is at stake, politically, in representing human emotions. Expressions such as “clinging,” “holding on,” and “letting go” refer to bodily experiences, but they also deliver ideological impact, validating some people’s emotional experiences while dismissing those of others. To examine the ways that human physiology and cultural ideology combine in emotion metaphors, this study compares the representations of jilted women’s emotions in Virgil’s *Aeneid*, Rudyard Kipling’s “The Phantom Rickshaw,” and Siri Hustvedt’s *The Summer without Men*. The study draws on John Bowlby’s theory of attachment, Lisa Feldman Barrett’s conceptual act theory of emotions, and Sara Ahmed’s and Sianne Ngai’s cultural criticism of the ways emotions are represented in political writing and literary fiction. The essay argues that metaphors for culturally discouraged emotions—such as refusing to “move on”—perform a hegemonic function. By making those less powerful feel ashamed of their anger, emotion metaphors may work to suppress cries against injustice.

An advertisement for American Standard VorMax toilets shows a tall, white man with a woman clinging to his back.<sup>1</sup> As he jogs along, she intones, “I love you, I love you, I love you.” With a knowing look, the man turns his eyes to the viewer. “No one likes a clinger,” he says. The ad compares a woman who loves too much to human waste clinging to a toilet bowl.

1. <http://www.ispot.tv/ad/7xDJ/american-standard-vormax-toilet-clinger>.

In metaphors for unpleasant emotions, physiology and culture combine.<sup>2</sup> Physical experience throbs in the word “emotion,” which derives from the Latin “*ex*” + “*movere*,” “to move out.”<sup>3</sup> Creative expressions for despised feelings offer cases through which to study the synergy of bodily impulses and cultural mandates. Sara Ahmed has noted that recent representations of emotions contrast “elevated” emotions with those that are “unruly” and need to be controlled.<sup>4</sup> Western cultures condemn some feelings as “negative,” including spite, self-pity, repressed rage, resentment, grudge-bearing, and personal hate. With repeated calls to “let go” and “move on,” self-help books urge readers to ban these emotions from their lives.<sup>5</sup>

One enters the politics of emotion metaphors when one considers who is telling whom what to feel. “It is not difficult to see how emotions are bound up with the securing of social hierarchy,” observes Ahmed.<sup>6</sup> As Sianne Ngai argues in *Ugly Feelings*, descriptions of unsavory emotions can work to invalidate social grievances. Labels such as “envious” delegitimize criticisms of injustice by establishing the critic’s psyche as flawed.<sup>7</sup> When writers craft metaphors for unloved emotions, more hangs in the balance than literary aesthetics. Representing emotions in particular ways often serves the interests of some people more than those of others.

If “negative” emotions have a family affinity, it is the feature of anger. Scholars of the emotions from William James to twenty-first-century neuroscientists have pointed out anger’s moral dimension, its roots in perceived unfairness.<sup>8</sup> Through half-repressed, messy

2. In my use of the term “emotion,” I follow the practice of historians, who apply this word to the complex, subjective feelings I discuss. I have avoided using the term “affect,” because I am focusing on individual experience and its representations. The literary characters I analyze are not intact, unchanging, or tightly bounded, but they retain distinct personalities.

3. <http://www.etymonline.com/index.php?term=emotion>.

4. Sara Ahmed, *The Cultural Politics of Emotion* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004), p. 3.

5. Spencer Johnson describes a character who “started to feel more alive, knowing that he was finally able to laugh at himself, let go and move on” (Spencer Johnson, *Who Moved My Cheese?* [London: Vermillion, 1999], p. 45).

6. Ahmed, *The Cultural Politics of Emotion* (above, n. 4), p. 4.

7. Sianne Ngai, *Ugly Feelings* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005), pp. 21, 127–128.

8. William James wrote that without the physiological changes that come with anger, this emotion would be reduced to a “cold-blooded and dispassionate judicial sentence . . . to the effect that a certain person or persons merit chastisement for their sins.” See William James, “What Is an Emotion?,” in *The Emotions*, by Carl Georg Lange and Wil-

emotions, the aggrieved throb out angry accusations. To some degree, the metaphors that represent self-pity or spite convey visceral, shared experiences. Human bodies differ, and grounded metaphors do not apply to all, but expressions such as the “heat of rage” seem to have physiological roots.<sup>9</sup> At the same time, calling emotions “unruly” emphasizes their disturbance of the elite. Emotion metaphors can work hegemonically to teach those less privileged what to feel.

This essay analyzes emotion metaphors used to characterize a subset of angry people. It compares the literary representations of three female characters abandoned by male lovers: Dido in Virgil’s *Aeneid*, Agnes Wessington in Rudyard Kipling’s “The Phantom Rickshaw,” and Mia Fredricksen in Siri Hustvedt’s *The Summer without Men*. Written centuries apart in different languages and genres, these works resonate in the ways they represent women’s responses to rejection. My analysis of these literary works draws on psychologist Lisa Feldman Barrett’s conceptual act theory of emotion, linguists George Lakoff’s and Zoltán Kövecses’s analyses of emotion metaphors, and psychologist John Bowlby’s theory of attachment. To varying degrees, these scholars emphasize the ways that language and culture shape emotional experiences. By examining figures for culturally condemned emotions, I hope to draw attention to the mandates behind these metaphors. Who benefits if some emotions are cultivated, and others uprooted? What potentially empowering motives are lost if readers internalize emotion metaphors and learn to be ashamed of what they feel?

### The Merging of Language and Physiology

The definition of “emotion” varies from field to field, and even within the natural and social sciences, scholars disagree about what an emotion involves. According to the paradigm shared by many neuroscientists and psychologists, all human beings experience variations of a few “basic emotions” associated with distinct patterns of neural activity and recognizable facial expressions. These emotions have evolutionary roots and include fear, anger, joy, and disgust. Eric R. Kandel’s respected textbook, *Principles of Neural Science*, defines emotion as “the set of physiological responses that occur more

liam James (New York, London: Hafner, [1922] 1967), pp. 11–30, quote on p. 17. Neuroscientist Giovanni Frazzetto writes that “anger inescapably entails morality” (Giovanni Frazzetto, *How We Feel: What Neuroscience Can and Can’t Tell Us about Our Emotions* [London: Doubleday, 2014], p. 7).

9. George Lakoff and Zoltán Kövecses, “The Cognitive Model of Anger Inherent in American English,” in *Cultural Models of Language and Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), pp. 195–220, quote on p. 196.

or less unconsciously when the brain detects certain challenging situations."<sup>10</sup> Kandel and his co-authors distinguish emotions from feelings, "the conscious experience of these somatic and cognitive changes."<sup>11</sup> In their view, emotions are unconscious, physiological reactions to environmental events, and they look similar from person to person; feelings are complex, subjective phenomena that vary among individuals. From this perspective, the subject of this article would be feelings, not emotions—but not all scientists who study emotions understand them this way.

In the past decade, psychologist Lisa Feldman Barrett has been offering evidence for the conceptual act model of emotions. Unlike the basic emotions theory, her hypothesis grants vital roles to individual experience, language, and culture in the shaping of emotions. In addition, Barrett and her colleagues have found discrepancies in the behavioral, neuroimaging, and facial expression data supporting basic emotions theory. Particular emotions such as anger can not be tied to consistent, recognizable patterns of behavior or neural activity distinct from those of other emotions.<sup>12</sup> To account for interpersonal and intrapersonal variations, Barrett has proposed an alternate hypothesis to fit the data. In her view, all humans share "core affect," an ever-fluctuating stream of neurophysiological responses to environmental changes.<sup>13</sup> Emotions emerge as people categorize core affect by relating momentary patterns to past patterns they have experienced in similar contexts. Barrett relies on cognitive scientist Lawrence W. Barsalou's notion of situated conceptualizations, which explains memories as sensory and motor reproductions of past experiences.<sup>14</sup> One understands "potato" as a re-activated swirl of neuronal firing that includes patterns evoked by past potatoes one has seen, heard, touched, smelled, and tasted. One learns what anger is in a similar way: by re-activating, combining, and comparing instances of core affect that have occurred in related contexts.

10. Eric R. Kandel, James H. Schwartz, Thomas M. Jessell, Steven A. Siegelbaum, and A. J. Hudspeth, *Principles of Neural Science*, 5th ed. (New York: McGraw Hill, 2013), p. 1079.

11. *Ibid.*

12. Lisa Feldman Barrett, "Solving the Emotion Paradox: Categorization and the Experience of Emotion," *Personality and Social Psychology Review* 10:1 (2006): 20–46, reference to p. 23.

13. *Ibid.*, p. 30.

14. Lawrence W. Barsalou, "Perceptual Symbol Systems," *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* 22 (1999): 577–660; and "Situated Simulation in the Human Conceptual System," *Language and Cognitive Processes* 18 (2003): 513–562.

In neither case does the recreated, combined pattern have to reach consciousness. One can categorize core affect as anger without ever knowing one is doing it. With time, a “simulator” for anger develops as one integrates core affect’s diverse and common features in different instances.<sup>15</sup> Because each person has had a unique body of experiences, anger will look a little different in each fMRI image and on each human face.

Human language influences the categorization of core affect, and in doing so, it shapes people’s experiences of emotions. Barrett has found that

language plays a strong causal role in the conceptual development . . . of emotion knowledge. Children acquire emotion categories that conform to their culture. . . . The emotion words for *anger* . . . serve as the glue that integrates a variety of different sensorimotor states into one category called *anger*.<sup>16</sup>

Even if the physiological changes underlying anger are broadly similar across humankind, individuals feel anger differently because they have had contrasting experiences, and because their languages have prompted them to categorize these experiences in distinct ways. Understanding one’s inner life is challenging, and culturally sanctioned metaphors offer cues about what and how to feel.

Having emerged from human brains and bodies, language also reflects physiological experiences. Psychologist Dedre Gentner has called language a “set of tools with which to construct and manipulate representations,” and these tools reflect the bodies that shaped them.<sup>17</sup> George Lakoff’s and Mark Johnson’s studies of colloquial metaphors indicate that common metaphoric expressions are signs of cognition at work, not decorative literary flourishes—at least, in English speakers.<sup>18</sup> Lakoff’s and Johnson’s research revealing the cognitive role of metaphor relies on philosopher Max Black’s observation that few metaphors merely substitute or compare terms. Black argued that in non-trivial metaphors, two concepts become “active together,” so that thinkers see relationships between them that trans-

15. Barrett, “Solving the Emotion Paradox” (above, n. 12), p. 34 .

16. *Ibid.* (emphasis in original).

17. Dedre Gentner and Susan Goldin-Meadow, *Language in Mind: Advances in the Study of Language and Thought* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2003), p. 223.

18. George Lakoff and Mark Johnson, *Metaphors We Live By* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, [1980] 2003). Lakoff and Johnson’s book arguing that metaphor is fundamental to cognition has been widely translated, and in several European languages, their examples of physiologically grounded metaphors “work.” Their evidence for the bodily basis of colloquial metaphors extends beyond the English language.

form their understandings of both.<sup>19</sup> Some metaphors, wrote Black, “enable us to see aspects of reality that the metaphor’s production helps to constitute.”<sup>20</sup> In the case of emotion metaphors, expressions such as “let go” and “move on” may shape emotional experiences as well as describe them. Human language’s capacity to create resonances through metaphor is one of its most powerful devices.

Linguist Zoltán Kövecses, who collaborated with Lakoff, shares Lakoff’s view that metaphors are culturally as well as physiologically constituted. In three decades of cross-cultural studies, Kövecses has noticed that emotions are often figured as fluids in containers, sometimes as hot fluids under pressure that may burst out. Emotion metaphors draw multiple creative connections. Anger may be represented as fire, an opponent, an aggressive animal, a natural force, or a social superior.<sup>21</sup> In the depiction of rage, certain metaphorical families predominate, implying a prototype or “script” for an emotional experience. This script can be detected—with variations—in many different cultures. The “prototypical anger scenario” implied by American English includes 1) an “offending event,” 2) “anger,” 3) an “attempt at control,” 4) “loss of control,” and 5) an “act of retribution.”<sup>22</sup> This sequence is often described in terms of boiling or exploding fluids. No other culture reproduces this script exactly, but many offer close variations. In Chinese emotion metaphors, bodily energy (“*qi*”) may exist in excess, shift its position in the body, or cause pressure in a specific body part.<sup>23</sup> In Japanese culture, anger metaphorically takes control of people when hot fluid rises from their bellies (“*hara*”) to their heads.<sup>24</sup> Given the increases in heart rate and blood pressure that come with anger, these metaphors have obvious physiological sources.

Kövecses believes that this bodily grounding transcends culture, but he warns, “It is necessary to go beyond both the view that . . . anger is simply motivated by human physiology and the view that it is simply a social construction. . . . It is *both* motivated by

19. Max Black, “Metaphor,” *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 55 (1954–1955): 273–294, quote on p. 285.

20. Max Black, “More about Metaphor,” *Dialectica* 31:3 (1977): 431–457, quote on p. 454.

21. Zoltán Kövecses, *Metaphor and Emotion: Language, Culture, and Body in Human Feeling* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), p. 21.

22. Lakoff and Kövecses, “The Cognitive Model of Anger Inherent in American English” (above, n. 9), p. 211.

23. Kövecses, *Metaphor and Emotion* (above, n. 21), pp. 150–151.

24. *Ibid.*, p. 152.

the human body *and* produced by a particular social and cultural environment."<sup>25</sup> As Barrett claims, language influences emotional experiences, which in turn can mold language. The question is how language, physiology, and memory interact. Metaphors for culturally condemned emotions offer insight into this interplay.

People rejected in relationships experience devastating emotions that are discouraged by many cultures. Metaphors for jilted people's pain tend to dismiss it, however, since emotional bonds are so often characterized in terms of physical ones. The bodily grounding of human languages pushes scientists and lay people toward metaphors that describe emotions in terms of space. Discussing relationships without terms such as "attached," "distant," or "close" takes considerable imagination. All of these adjectives refer to spatial positions and evoke visual or somatosensory images such as that of one person clinging to another's back. Whatever their sensory modality, they function metaphorically.

In his classic study of relationships, psychologist John Bowlby devoted considerable thought to his choice of terms. He sought to explain variations in young children's feelings toward their parents, since some children easily tolerated separations, whereas others protested if left even briefly. "Clinging behavior, either literal or figurative, can be seen at every age," observed Bowlby.<sup>26</sup> Metaphoric "clinging," adopted from popular culture, represents unwanted attention in terms of a persistent, unpleasant touch. It suggests the undesired adherence of a soft object to a hard one, such as a vine clinging to a tree, and it encourages sympathy for the "tree" and disapproval for the parasitic "vine." Bowlby avoided "clinging," along with terms such as "jealous," "possessive," "greedy," and "overdependent," since he believed these words carry "an adverse value judgment that is held to be inappropriate and unhelpful."<sup>27</sup> Instead, he proposed the term "anxious attachment," which "respects the person's natural desire for a close relationship . . . and recognizes that he is apprehensive lest the relationship be ended."<sup>28</sup> Through experiments and surveys of other scientists' work, Bowlby showed that anxious attachment was not an inborn character defect. It resulted from experiences early in life that were carried to later relationships.

In the quest to build knowledge about relationships, "attachment" has been the prevailing metaphor. It is crucial to remember

25. *Ibid.*, p. 14 (emphasis in original).

26. John Bowlby, *Separation: Anxiety and Anger* (New York: Basic Books, 1973), p. 211.

27. *Ibid.*, p. 211.

28. *Ibid.*, p. 213.



this term is metaphoric, however, and to examine it critically. Attachment suggests gluing one solid object to another—creating an appendage that the first object did not always have and in the future may not need. Attachment does not convey the intermeshing of lives that loving relationships involve. The term offers a convenient figure for anyone who wants to end a relationship, and a disabling one for someone who wants to remain involved. It justifies partners who want to detach themselves from unwanted lovers, but it bewilders partners who feel integrated with their mates. It validates complaints about “clingers” but offers no language to partners who feel so entangled with their mates that a breakup will tear their tissues. Bowlby’s term, chosen out of respect for people’s emotional needs, still excludes much of human experience. It is time to think about other metaphors to describe the emotions inspired by human relationships.

### ***The Aeneid: Impeded Motion***

Virgil’s *Aeneid* offers one of the West’s most influential portraits of an abandoned woman.<sup>29</sup> Like Homer’s *Odyssey*, the epic poem chronicles movement and obstructed motion.<sup>30</sup> In the quest to reach Italy and found Rome, the Trojan Aeneas does not progress linearly, but he and his narrative have a defined goal. Virgil composed the epic in 30–19 BCE to solidify the Roman culture’s founding myth and justify its defeat of Carthage in the Punic Wars (246–146 BCE).<sup>31</sup> In this narrative context, Aeneas’s passionate relationship with the Carthaginian queen, Dido, in Book IV can function only as an obstacle. Just as Circe, the sirens, and the lotus-eaters threatened Odysseus, Dido hinders the hero. Virgil’s metaphors do not involve clinging, but Dido’s impediment of Aeneas’s forward motion helped build the cultural tradition that shows a woman hanging on a jogger’s back.

Dido rules a powerful state whose welfare depends on her physical and mental health. Since the death of her first husband, she has

29. I am grateful to Marjorie Woods, whose talk, “Classical Emotions in the Medieval Classroom,” at the Max Planck Institute for Human Development on November 18, 2014, inspired me to include Dido in this banned emotions project. Woods argues that medieval instructors used Virgil’s descriptions of Dido’s emotions to teach students about human feelings. <https://www.mpib-berlin.mpg.de/en/aktuelles/veranstaltungen/classical-emotions-in-the-medieval-classroom>.

30. *Encyclopædia Britannica Online*, s.v. “Aeneid,” accessed May 13, 2016, <http://www.britannica.com/topic/Aeneid>.

31. *Encyclopædia Britannica Online*, s.v. “Third Punic War,” accessed May 13, 2016, <http://www.britannica.com/event/Third-Punic-War>.

vowed not to remarry—until Aeneas lands on her shores. Virgil's judgmental narrator reproaches her, but with the gods maneuvering in a parallel realm, no human actor in this tragedy is fully responsible for his or her actions. Through vivid descriptions of Dido's feelings, Virgil works to evoke sympathy even as he depicts Dido's emotions as a force to be overcome.

Virgil prepares the ground for Dido's wrath by conveying the force of her passion. The Roman poet depicts female desire in an evocative, visceral way that few writers in subsequent millennia have matched. His representations of Dido urges prompt readers not only to see what she is seeing, but to feel her longing in their bodies.<sup>32</sup> In Barsalou's and Barrett's terms, Virgil encourages readers to simulate Dido's love so that they can share her emotions when it is sacrificed. At first, Virgil conveys her lust through a mixed metaphor: her desire is a "longing that her heart's blood fed, a wound or inward fire eating her away."<sup>33</sup> This hybrid metaphor gains force when the narrator comments, "The inward fire eats the soft marrow away, and the internal wound bleeds on in silence"<sup>34</sup> Virgil seems to appeal to readers' memories, so that they can recreate passionate yearnings they have felt in the past. When Dido "presse[s] her body on the couch he left," both male and female readers may feel stirrings.<sup>35</sup> One vivid simile may make readers wonder how responsible Dido is for her pain: she "roamed through all the city, like a doe hit by an arrow shot from far away."<sup>36</sup> This figure represents her as a victim, and it sets the pattern for many that follow: rather than moving linearly, purposefully, progressively, she wanders at random, driven by emotions that feel like physical pains.

As Virgil shows the Queen's vulnerability, he encourages readers to identify. With a few deft descriptions, he makes it clear how attractive the Trojan warrior is. Aeneas "walk[s] with sunlit grace upon him," and Dido senses "the manhood of the man, the pride of his birth."<sup>37</sup> This attraction is mutual. When Juno—who seeks to hinder Aeneas—creates a storm to unite the lovers in a cave, Virgil's poetry

32. In *Dreaming by the Book*, Elaine Scarry analyzes the techniques poets and novelists use to encourage readers to form mental images. Scarry focuses on visual mental imagery, but Virgil encourages auditory and somatosensory imagery as well; see Elaine Scarry, *Dreaming by the Book* (New York: Farrar, Strauss, Giroux, 1999).

33. Virgil, *The Aeneid*, trans. Robert Fitzgerald (New York: Random House, 1983), p. 95.

34. *Ibid.*, p. 97.

35. *Ibid.*, p. 98.

36. *Ibid.*, pp. 97–98.

37. *Ibid.*, pp. 101, 95.

arcs with sexual energy: "Torches of lightning blazed, High Heaven became witness to the marriage, and nymphs cried out wild hymns from a mountain top."<sup>38</sup> Both Dido and Aeneas want the union, but they differ about its duration. The erotic bond that fulfills the queen keeps the warrior from achieving fulfillment.

Virgil's metaphors in *The Aeneid* associate male forces with linear drives and female desires with cyclic motions. Juno's storm typifies the acts of female powers—chaotic winds that swirl, circle, and scatter. Even though Juno's storm has a purpose, its force contrasts with Aeneas's desire to found Rome. The Trojan on a mission may sail in curves, but his will is a linear vector. In evocative passages, Virgil describes the work of Rumor, whose female mischief serves as a leitmotif:

Through all the African cities Rumor goes—nimble as quicksilver among evils. . . . As many tongues and buzzing mouths as eyes, as many pricked-up ears, by night she flies between the earth and heaven shrieking through darkness, and she never turns her eye-lids down to sleep. . . . In those days rumor took an evil joy at filling countrysides with whispers, whispers, gossip of what was done, and never done.<sup>39</sup>

Like wind or water, Rumor exerts powerful effects but lacks a rational plan of action. Throughout Carthage, Rumor reports that Dido and Aeneas "reveled all the winter long . . . , prisoners of lust."<sup>40</sup> While Rumor rushes, forward motion ceases: Aeneas is stuck in Carthage, and Dido's domain deteriorates.

Concerned, Jupiter asks Mercury to send Zephyrs—directed, message-bearing winds. "The man should sail: that is the whole point," says the King of the Gods.<sup>41</sup> He urges Aeneas to think of his son, Ascanius, even if Aeneas is too smitten to think of himself. In depicting the hero's reaction to this prod, Virgil takes as much care to invite simulations in the reader as he did when describing Dido's desire. Aeneas "felt his hackles rise, his voice choke in his throat."<sup>42</sup> The poet's language makes it possible to feel his consternation and his desire to set things right. The metaphor used to figure Dido's lust now depicts Aeneas's will, since he "burn[s] only to be gone."<sup>43</sup> Like the

38. *Ibid.*, p. 101.

39. *Ibid.*, p. 102.

40. *Ibid.*, p. 102.

41. *Ibid.*, p. 104.

42. *Ibid.* p. 105.

43. *Ibid.*, p. 105.

descriptions of love, those of conscience and ambition have bodily groundings, and they encourage readers to imagine both characters' emotions.

The female force Rumor, which has never ceased to swirl, alerts Dido that Aeneas is going to sail. In lines that mirror Virgil's description of the wounded doe, the Queen "traverse[s] the whole city, all aflame with rage, like a Bacchante driven wild."<sup>44</sup> In contrast to Aeneas's refocused energy, Dido's emotion produces cyclic wanderings. She berates him for planning to steal away and demands, "Can our love not hold you?"<sup>45</sup> The very terms in which she offers her plea suggest the impeded motion Aeneas fears.

In marked contrast to the way Virgil depicts Dido, the Roman poet represents Aeneas as mastering his emotions—with Jupiter's help. Despite Dido's pleas, "The man by Jove's command held fast his eyes and fought down the emotion in his heart."<sup>46</sup> His father, he tells Dido, has appeared to him in dreams and urged him to sail to Italy for his son's sake. Although Aeneas supposedly wants to stay, he must sacrifice passion for duty. Dido, who has neglected her domain for her passion, may come across as relatively selfish. For Roman readers, this contrast might have formed a pleasing narrative: after a long struggle, Roman reason defeated African emotion in the costly and painful Punic Wars.

While Aeneas invokes his mission to reach Italy, Dido uses her emotion as a persuasive tactic. She begs Aeneas, "by these tears," to stay, since against his arguments of duty, she can offer only her authentic feelings.<sup>47</sup> In sexually suggestive terms, she reminds him, "I took the man in, thrown up on this coast in dire need, and in my madness then contrived a place for him in my domain."<sup>48</sup> In contrast to Aeneas, Dido makes no apparent effort to quash her emotions. She rages, accuses, and insults Aeneas's mother; she vows revenge beyond death. Dido seems to *be* her humiliation and fury rather than a distinct entity trying to control them.

Aeneas is unmoved by her pleas, and in Virgil's metaphorical system, Dido's wild, emotional gusts contrast with the hero's fixed resolve. In a visually evocative simile, Virgil illustrates the difference between Aeneas's and Dido's emotional states:

44. *Ibid.*, p. 106.

45. *Ibid.*, p. 106.

46. *Ibid.*, p. 107.

47. *Ibid.*, p. 106.

48. *Ibid.*, p. 109.

Just as when the north winds from the Alps this way and that contend among themselves to tear away an oak tree hale with age, the wind and tree cry, and the buffeted trunk showers high foliage to the earth, but holds on bedrock, for the roots go down far . . . just so this captain, buffeted by a gale of pleas . . . felt their moving power in his great heart, and yet his will stood fast; tears fell in vain.<sup>49</sup>

Virgil conveys Dido's feelings through images of furious, purposeless movement. Although in this simile, Aeneas's inner force is "holding on," he seems more capable of directed motion.

Aeneas's resolve heightens Dido's desperation, and just as Virgil urged readers to feel her desire, he works to make them experience her rage. The fire that served as a vehicle for her lust now conveys the intensity of her wrath. "Oh, I am swept away burning by furies!" cries the raging queen.<sup>50</sup> As Dido watches Aeneas's men prepare their ships, the narrator addresses her directly: "At that sight, what were your emotions, Dido? Sighing how deeply, looking out and down from your high tower on the seething shore."<sup>51</sup> This question is really directed at the reader, who may feel prompted to answer in her place. The response is painful to imagine and harder to articulate. Devastated, Dido "ran in sickness from his sight and from the light of day."<sup>52</sup> Along with cyclic wandering, disease and darkness represent her emotional state.

Unable to stand her pain and humiliation, Dido resolves to commit suicide. Her preparations for death parallel Aeneas's outfitting of his fleet, since both are goal-oriented mobilizations. Dido plans her death as a performance, a dramatic, communicative act. Summarized as a message, her communication might read, "You've hurt me, and I'm going to show you how much!" Dido asks her sister to prepare a funeral pyre in her "inner court" and to top it with Aeneas's arms, his clothes, and their marriage bed. Dido does not conceive of emotion as something to be controlled, but she wants to stage-manage her death. She prepares her suicide as a spectacular undoing of the passion that unmade her life. Besides allowing her to escape from pain, her death will function as a violent accusation, a shrill awakener of guilt. Although she prays for people "bound unequally by love," she seems moved mainly by rage.<sup>53</sup>

49. *Ibid.*, pp. 111–112.

50. *Ibid.*, p. 109.

51. *Ibid.*, p. 110.

52. *Ibid.*, p. 109.

53. *Ibid.*, p. 114.

Male gods help Aeneas steady his resolve, whereas Juno assists Dido haphazardly. Mercury warns Aeneas that Dido is “whipping herself on to heights of anger,” actively cultivating her emotions, and she may be capable of anything.<sup>54</sup> Aeneas sails before dawn, and when Dido spots his receding fleet, she wants to tear him to pieces. She vows eternal enmity between her people and his, a legacy that supposedly caused the Punic Wars. Although Aeneas will not witness her death, she still enacts the gruesome, erotic suicide. On a funeral pyre, she stabs herself with her Trojan lover’s sword. In depicting her death, Virgil aims to evoke emotion by inviting readers to use their senses: “Her chest-wound whistled air. Three times she struggled up on one elbow and each time fell back on the bed. Her gaze went wavering as she looked for heaven’s light and groaned at finding it.”<sup>55</sup> Dido’s death is hideously slow, and no detachment metaphor can do justice to the annihilation she is feeling.

Instead, Virgil depicts her death so that readers can empathize with the defeated queen. His descriptions encourage readers to recreate physiologically grounded emotional experiences in order to feel the emotions driving Dido. At the same time, as Lisa Barrett indicates, Virgil’s powerful metaphors may shape readers’ future emotional experiences.<sup>56</sup> He depicts a Western hero who sacrifices passion to found Rome, and an African Queen who sacrifices her Kingdom for passion—if she can be said to choose at all. The Roman poet does not use attachment as a metaphor, but his representation of a bond that needs breaking has influenced subsequent understandings of love. From Aeneas’s perspective, attachment and detachment might aptly describe a temporary, non-transformative bond. From Dido’s point of view, attachment and detachment could not possibly describe the transformation of love or the soul-rending agony of rejection. Instead, Virgil uses vehicles of fire, darkness, and crazed wandering, which are more likely to evoke empathy in readers. Empathy is not respect, however, of which Virgil’s metaphors awaken little. By depicting female emotion as a deterrent, he left a dangerous metaphoric legacy.

### “The Phantom Rickshaw”: A Bitch on Wheels

In Rudyard Kipling’s story, “The Phantom Rickshaw” (1885), a woman moving in circles proves contagious.<sup>57</sup> Kipling published this tale of

54. *Ibid.*, p. 116.

55. *Ibid.*, p. 121.

56. Barrett, “Solving the Emotion Paradox” (above, n. 12), p. 34.

57. William J. Scheick, “Hesitation in Kipling’s ‘The Phantom Rickshaw,’” *English Literature in Transition* 29:1 (1986): 48–53, reference to p. 48.

a jilted woman's ghost in the 1885 Christmas volume of the *Civil and Military Gazette*. A revised version appeared in his collection of "eerie tales" in 1888. Kipling's protagonist describes himself as "Theobald Jack Pansay, a well-educated Bengal Civilian in the year of grace 1885," but readers encounter Jack's story within an intriguing frame.<sup>58</sup> Before meeting Jack, readers hear two conflicting narratives of what killed him: 1) Dr. Heatherlegh's claim that Jack died of overwork; and 2) the narrator's view that "a little bit of the Dark World came through and pressed him to death."<sup>59</sup> In the narrator's opinion, Jack was "hag-ridden," tormented by an unwanted woman.<sup>60</sup>

"The Phantom Rickshaw" can be read as a fantastic tale, since the frame makes readers "hesitate" between medical and supernatural explanations.<sup>61</sup> In late nineteenth-century India under colonial rule, Heatherlegh's narrative would have made sense. Simla, the northern town where the story takes place, was known as a refuge for British administrators exhausted from heat, long hours, and disturbing work.<sup>62</sup> British officials who became mentally ill received treatments such as "prolonged bathing" and "Swedish drills"—much like the "cold-water baths and strong exercise" Heatherlegh prescribes for Jack.<sup>63</sup> Simultaneously, the colonial setting makes the "Dark World" narrative plausible on many levels. Jack may have been working too hard, but he also seems to have been haunted by an ex-lover pulled by four native ghosts.

Written for readers familiar with colonial culture, "The Phantom Rickshaw" is extremely funny. Like *The Aeneid*, it comes from a male point of view, and it describes an affair that would have spawned clubroom jokes. Jack meets Agnes on a ship steaming from Gravesend

58. Rudyard Kipling, "The Phantom Rickshaw," in *The Man Who Would Be King and Other Stories* (New York: Dover), pp. 1–19, quote on p. 8.

59. *Ibid.*, p. 2.

60. *Ibid.*, p. 2.

61. Scheick, "Hesitation" (above, n. 57), pp. 48–49.

62. Debashis Bandyopadhyay, "The Past Unearthed: New Reading of Ruskin Bond's Supernatural Tales," *Children's Literature Association Quarterly* 30:1 (2005): 53–71, reference to p. 58.

63. Bandyopadhyay, "The Past Unearthed" (above, n. 62), p. 58; Kipling, "The Phantom Rickshaw" (above, n. 58), p. 12. Bandyopadhyay points out how problematic mentally ill Europeans were in a culture determined to show white supremacy. After British asylum inmates in Calcutta were seen "driving scavenger carts," officials moved asylums from major cities to smaller towns, where the patients would be less visible. According to Bandyopadhyay, Heatherlegh's improvised hospital "is modelled on these asylums," and Kipling "was acquainted with these treatments" (Bandyopadhyay, "The Past Unearthed" [above, n. 62], p. 58).

to Bombay, and he recalls that by the journey's end, "both she and I were desperately and unreasoningly in love."<sup>64</sup> Agnes is married to a Bombay officer, but neither Agnes nor Jack seems to care about her husband's existence. "In matters of this sort," Jack observes, "there is always one who gives and another who accepts. From the first day of our ill-omened attachment, I was conscious that Agnes's passion was a stronger, a more dominant, and . . . a purer sentiment than mine."<sup>65</sup> In describing Jack's relationship with Agnes, Kipling ironically employs the classic fire metaphor for passion, evoking laughs both at his characters and at his own language. Jack knows that his desire resembles Aeneas's more than Dido's, and after one season in Simla, he reports that his "fire of straw burnt itself out to a pitiful end."<sup>66</sup> In no uncertain terms, Jack tells Agnes that he is "sick of her presence, tired of her company, and weary of the sound of her voice."<sup>67</sup> Like Aeneas, he would like to detach himself and move on, but Agnes speaks a different metaphorical language.

When Agnes refuses to accept Jack's rejection, his feelings change from pity to hate. His progression through infatuation, weariness, and frustration to rage make sense because he controls the inner narrative. The reader can know Agnes's emotions only through Jack, and through the narrator who provides the outer frame. Before long, Jack has come to feel "blind hate—the same instinct, I suppose, which prompts a man to savagely stamp on the spider he has but half killed."<sup>68</sup> His comparison figures Agnes as the classic spinning female, but emotionally, it reveals much more. Before starting a relationship that Jack knew would soon end, he "never hesitated to consider how Agnes would feel."<sup>69</sup> After Agnes dies, apparently from despair, she and her rickshaw mysteriously reappear. In Western folklore, ghosts often return to remind the living of unredressed grievances. Probably, Agnes is rematerializing to show Jack that her rejection was unfair. Whether or not Jack has emotionally "killed" Agnes, he may believe that he has. His spider simile suggests he is suffering attacks of conscience, and the phantom rickshaw pursuing him may be a "psychological representation of guilt."<sup>70</sup> Through her

64. Kipling, "The Phantom Rickshaw" (above, n. 58), p. 3.

65. *Ibid.*, p. 3.

66. *Ibid.*, p. 3.

67. *Ibid.*, p. 3.

68. *Ibid.*, p. 4.

69. Scheick, "Hesitation" (above, n. 57), p. 51.

70. Bandyopadhyay, "The Past Unearthed" (above, n. 62), p. 58.



insistent reappearances, she convinces him that her grievance has merit.

The fact that Agnes returns with her rickshaw hints that Jack feels guilty about more than Agnes. As Debashis Bandyopadhyay has noticed, Jack's behavior toward his rejected lover "smacks of British attitude to the colonized Indians."<sup>71</sup> Although Agnes wanted a relationship with Jack, and the Indians did not want to be colonized, both have been used as disposable objects to fulfill white men's desires; both have been treated as less than human. In Jack's narrative, Agnes speaks little, but her emotions come through in his descriptions of the rickshaw he sees even after his cold baths. One might read the rickshaw as an alternate, visual metaphor for emotions Jack has ignored: the desperate anger of people whose human qualities have gone unrecognized.

In Kipling's tale, visibility works literally and metaphorically. Only Jack can see Agnes's spectral vehicle; his fiancée, Kitty, and her horse pass through it as though it were empty air. Jack tries to convince himself the rickshaw is an illusion, since "one may see ghosts of men and women, but surely never coolies and carriages."<sup>72</sup> In his mind, the four men pulling Agnes can not be ghosts, since they were never human to begin with. Jack learns that the four men who hauled Agnes were brothers, and that all four recently died of cholera. For the first time, he wonders how much Agnes paid them, what hours they worked, and what they did when unharnessed. Until now, he has never really seen them.

Kipling's descriptions of the phantom rickshaw suggest the tense coexistences of colonial India. The words "black" and "white" recur continually. Both alive and as ghosts, Agnes's men wear black and white uniforms, and Jack recalls her as "a white face flitting by in the rickshaw with the black and white liveries."<sup>73</sup> To Jack, the men's uniforms look like magpies' feathers, and he refers to Agnes's "accursed 'magpie' jhampanies."<sup>74</sup> The insistent imagery of black against white speaks of the colonial empire Jack is serving. One other bird figures in his perceptions of Agnes, who calls to him with an "eternal cuckoo cry."<sup>75</sup> "Jack, darling!" she repeats. "I'm sure it's all a mistake . . . ; and we'll be good friends again someday. Please forgive

71. *Ibid.*, p. 63.

72. Kipling, "The Phantom Rickshaw" (above, n. 58), p. 8.

73. *Ibid.*, p. 4.

74. *Ibid.*, p. 5.

75. *Ibid.*, p. 4.

me, Jack dear!"<sup>76</sup> By cultural reputation, cuckoos and magpies are parasitic, thieving birds. Cuckoos deposit eggs to be raised by others, and magpies steal shiny objects. In an ironic reversal, the terms Jack imposes on Agnes and her men suggest his own theft and parasitism as a colonial official.

Kipling depicts a failure to communicate that runs well beyond male and female colonials. Jack calls Agnes a cuckoo because of his ears, she sings the same notes each time he hears her. Close examination reveals this is not true; her utterances are similar, but they never match exactly.<sup>77</sup> Jack's reference to "the irksome monotony of her appeal" typifies the complaints of those who hold power: unhappy women and natives often *do* repeat accusations—because no one is listening or taking them seriously.<sup>78</sup> Central to Agnes's appeals is a plea to be forgiven, maybe because she thinks she has been rejected for being bad. This tactic, too, suggests the moves of colonized people. One can disrupt a system, Sianne Ngai has observed, by following its rules too well.<sup>79</sup> When direct confrontation is not an option, one can demoralize rulers through exaggerated humility and politeness. With her endless requests to be forgiven, Agnes implies that Jack should be asking forgiveness of her. "Why can't I be left alone—left alone and happy?" he asks.<sup>80</sup> Romantically and politically, he is sick of hearing about the devastation he has enabled.

In Kipling's hands, Jack feels this pain all the more keenly because he slips into Agnes's role.<sup>81</sup> Once he is engaged to the confident Kitty, he finds himself cantering after her. When they ride, Kitty gallops off, "fully expecting . . . that [he] should follow her."<sup>82</sup> Kitty's rejection of him closely parallels his break-up with Agnes. Jack's final words to Agnes "might have made even a man wince" and "cut the dying woman . . . like the blow of a whip."<sup>83</sup> When Kitty learns of

76. *Ibid.*, p. 4.

77. Compare the first instance of Agnes's "cuckoo cry" with some of the subsequent ones: "Please forgive me, Jack; I didn't mean to make you angry; but it's true, it's true!" (*ibid.*, p. 5), and "Jack! Jack, darling! . . . It's some hideous mistake, I'm sure. Please forgive me, Jack, and let's be friends again" (*ibid.*, p. 7).

78. *Ibid.*, p. 4.

79. Ngai, *Ugly Feelings* (above, n. 7), p. 67.

80. Kipling, "The Phantom Rickshaw" (above, n. 58), p. 15.

81. William Scheick observes the finely crafted symmetry of Kipling's story: just as Jack failed to hesitate in starting a relationship, Kitty ends one without pausing to reflect; see Scheick, "Hesitation" (above, n. 57), p. 51.

82. Kipling, "The Phantom Rickshaw" (above, n. 58), p. 7.

83. *Ibid.*, p. 5.

Jack's relationship with Agnes, she breaks their engagement with a literal blow: "My answer was the cut of her riding-whip across my face from mouth to eye and a word or two of farewell that even now I cannot write down."<sup>84</sup> As a rejected man, Jack finds himself harboring the emotions that Agnes once felt for him.

Jack also learns what it means to be invisible, like the natives over whom he has ruled. Kitty and her new suitor ride past him, and "for any sign she gave I might have been a dog in the road."<sup>85</sup> To the woman he loves, he has ceased to be human, perhaps even to be real. By degrees, Jack begins to feel as though "the rickshaw and [he] were the only realities in a world of shadows."<sup>86</sup> Accompanied by a rickshaw only he can see, he suspects that Kitty and Dr. Heatherlegh are ghosts, and only he and Agnes are real. His new state of mind suggests a colonial world of parallel realms, each functioning oblivious to the other. To the British, the dark men doing their labor are ghosts; to the Indians, the white men passing in rickshaws are spectral. Jack's unwanted affinity with the supernatural suggests his relationship with India, of which he is an integral part.<sup>87</sup>

In this story of a colonial "bitch on wheels," Kipling depicts a woman and a people who will not disappear. Although told, like *The Aeneid*, from a male point of view, "The Phantom Rickshaw" figures a rejected woman's emotions in a compelling way. As a metaphorical vehicle for pain and rage, Kipling chooses not a bursting container or attached objects but . . . a vehicle. The two-wheeled cart pulled by four native ghosts appears and roams unpredictably. As a dynamic, visual metaphor, it defies the imagery of detachment and progressive motion that serve more powerful colonizers. In representing the emotions of a jilted woman, Kipling has captured the feelings of people whose emotional lives differ so greatly, they experience each other as "ghosts."<sup>88</sup> When these phantoms assert their identities, not only do they disrupt linear progress; they lead their colonizers in circles.

84. *Ibid.*, p. 14.

85. *Ibid.*, p. 16.

86. *Ibid.*, p. 16.

87. Bandyopadhyay, "Unearthing the Past" (above, n. 62), p. 63.

88. Kipling, who supported British colonialism, was well aware of its complexities. Even though Kipling supported the British Empire, he was "not only under the influence of one set of discourses" (Tabish Khair, "Kipling on the Phantom Rickshaw: Between Words and a Hard Place," *Poetry Nation Review* 27:1 [2000]: 1–10, quote on p. 10).

### ***The Summer without Men: A Shattered Brain***

When a twenty-first century female author writes about rejection, the metaphors for emotions change significantly, but not completely. The common features of these emotion metaphors may derive from cultural confluences, shared bodily experiences, or both. Siri Hustvedt's *Summer without Men* offers a jilted woman's perspective, and Hustvedt figures her character's emotions through shattering. Mia Fredricksen, her sharp, witty heroine, suffers a psychotic breakdown when Boris, her husband of thirty years, asks for a "pause" to pursue a relationship with a younger woman. The fact that Mia's abandonment sends her to a hospital suggests that in defining herself, she has overemphasized her relationship with Boris.<sup>89</sup> But this fifty-five-year-old poet and scholar has plenty of creative brilliance left. Rather than destroying her, her illness and recovery smash a confining case and free her identity to assume more complex forms.

Initially, Hustvedt represents Mia's emotions through metaphors of explosive shattering. Mia, who narrates, describes thoughts that "burst, ricocheted, and careened into one another like popcorn kernels in a microwave bag."<sup>90</sup> In the psychiatric ward, Mia records her thoughts in a notebook that she ironically labels "brain shards."<sup>91</sup> References to fragments recur early in the novel, but in this story of evolving identity, shattering constitutes only part of the metaphoric system.

Hustvedt's line drawings offer a visual metaphor of Mia's changing emotional state. In the first illustration, a woman is confined to a square, and the viewer sees only her desperate face and reaching arms. The second sketch shows her with head and shoulders above the box, gripping it and looking out with ironic amusement. In the third, the woman—who is always naked—lies atop the square, narrating to a larger woman who looks down sympathetically. In the final image, the once-confined woman flies happily across the page, ignoring the box below. If one flips through these drawings quickly, one experiences Mia's summer without men as an animated sequence. What has shattered is not her self, but a structure that has been encasing her identity and hampering its growth. Like Jack and

89. Britta Bein proposes that before Mia's illness, "Boris seems to be the one who has been providing meaning for her" (Britta Bein, "Present Women/Absent Men in Siri Hustvedt's *The Summer without Men* (2011)," *Current Objectives in Postgraduate American Studies* 14:1 [2013]: 1–19, quote on p. 2).

90. Siri Hustvedt, *The Summer without Men* (New York: Picador-Henry Holt, 2011), p. 1.

91. *Ibid.*, p. 2.

Aeneas, Mia has been restricted by a relationship, but not one that blocks linear motion. For thirty years, her marriage-box has molded her identity as a shell defines a clam's. As Hustvedt's drawings indicate, her novel plays with containment as a way to represent the relations between emotions and selfhood, but she depicts containers as temporary. The box Hustvedt sketches represents not so much a human body, as Lakoff or Kövecses might argue, as it does a way of living that Mia has helped establish.

In Hustvedt's novel, Mia's relationship with space works metaphorically. The middle-aged poet recalls writing at her kitchen table while her daughter Daisy used to nap. Mia realizes that she has not "fought for [her]self" and reflects, "Some people just take the room they need, elbowing out intruders to take possession of a space."<sup>92</sup> The plot is driven by Mia's decision to leave New York and teach for a summer in her native Minnesota town. In her determination to heal, Mia returns to an old space, but her move is not regressive. She starts by cleaning the dusty house she has rented, and after two days, she observes that "the savage activity left the rooms sharpened. The musty, indefinite edges of every object in my visual field had taken on a precision and clarity that cheered me"<sup>93</sup> In the past, she had not taken command of her space. Now that she does, Hustvedt's description of the sharp-edged house suggests the changing state of Mia's mind.

Although Mia was diagnosed with Brief Reactive Psychosis, her delusions were metaphorically, if not literally accurate. As a poet, she recalls, "for years I had been toiling away at work few wanted or understood, . . . [and] my isolation had become increasingly painful. . . . Rejection accumulates; lodges itself like black bile in the belly. . . . Paranoia chases rejection."<sup>94</sup> When Mia was "delusional," she thought that Boris would move into their apartment with "the Pause" and force Mia out onto the street. Convinced that Boris was in league with "them," she heard voices saying, "Of course he hates you. Everyone hates you."<sup>95</sup> Although Mia seems to have imagined a conspiracy, her perception of one rejection too many rings true, and her fear of homelessness is socially realistic. How many women, drugged and interned for mental illness, have merely been reporting their internalizations of the contempt they hear all around them?

92. *Ibid.*, p. 6.

93. *Ibid.*, p. 7.

94. *Ibid.*, pp. 55–56.

95. *Ibid.*, p. 43.

Whatever the nature of Mia's madness, her illness does not recede suddenly. Her pathology mirrors her health, and the two fold into each other like yin and yang.<sup>96</sup> During the summer, Mia exchanges e-mails with a mysterious "Mr. Nobody." She suspects her correspondent may be Leonard, a learned patient she met in the hospital, but several hints indicate that Mr. Nobody is a lingering "voice" of her own making.<sup>97</sup> Nobody torments her with messages saying she is worthless until she realizes, "Now the words on the screen, the words of Nobody, had taken the place of the accusing voices in my head."<sup>98</sup> As she reflects on these messages, she realizes that Boris has treated her as a "Ms. Nobody," interrupting her "as if [she] were an airy nothing."<sup>99</sup> Probably, Nobody's messages have an internal source.

Mia is an intellectual heavyweight, but she has trouble dealing with her emotions. References to her family make it clear she is ashamed of crying because she was raised to suppress her feelings. Her mother "roared" at her for "crying jags and . . . eruptions," and her father stammered, "I can't—I can't," unable to express any emotion at all.<sup>100</sup> "I always thought you felt too much," her mother tells her, "repeating a family theme."<sup>101</sup> Mia's therapist, Dr. S, hypothesizes that the women in Mia's family "stepp[ed] around" her father's feelings (which included unfulfilled love for another woman), and that Mia recreated this scenario in her marriage.<sup>102</sup> Considering her circumstances, Mia cries relatively little during the summer, although she refers ashamedly to her weeping in the months before. Her references to crying, both her own and that of other characters, tend to be sarcastic and dismissive. When she learns that Boris has moved in with "the Pause," Mia reports that she "took it like a woman. [She] wept," and that she "leaked a small bucket of tears" to Dr. S.<sup>103</sup> Her older sister calls her a crybaby, and she does not fight the charge. Mia differs from Dido and Agnes in not wanting to manifest

96. Bein argues that for Mia, giving meaning to her illness is inseparable from giving meaning to her life: "The question of Mia's story is not how to get rid of her illness, but rather, how to deal with it in order to bring about a more positive self-definition" (Bein, "Present Women" [above, n. 89], p. 7).

97. Bein has also proposed that "Mr. Nobody" seems to be a part of Mia "rather than an independent being" (Bein, "Present Women" [above, n. 89], p. 13).

98. Hustvedt, *The Summer without Men* (above, n. 90), p. 56.

99. *Ibid.*, p. 74.

100. *Ibid.*, pp. 69, 44.

101. *Ibid.*, p. 13.

102. *Ibid.*, p. 51.

103. *Ibid.*, p. 73, 81.

her pain, either to Boris or to anyone else. Rather than demanding redress, she tries to discover who she is without the box.

More than crying, Mia despises self-pity, as most twenty-first-century Americans have been taught to do. In a metaphor that recalls John Bunyan's Slough of Despond, she realizes, "I had fallen into the ugly depths of self-pity, a terrain just above the even more hideous lowlands of despair."<sup>104</sup> Hustvedt adopts a traditional metaphor, associating the pain and rage of rejection with getting "bogged down" in mud.<sup>105</sup> In contrast to Hustvedt's line drawings of upward motion, crying and self-pity represent sludgy depths. Rejected people are often chastised for pitying themselves, prolonging their pain, or even taking pleasure in it. Some reprovers claim the sufferers have selfishly withdrawn; others, that they are using their emotions manipulatively. Mia feels contempt for self-absorbed people, and she worries that she might become one. On the psychiatric ward, "crying jags" revealed the patients' pathological self-enclosure, and health meant letting the world back in.<sup>106</sup> When a June storm reminds Mia of "the immensity of the world," she relishes the sounds of wind and rain.<sup>107</sup> Afterward, she is shocked when Dr. S. tells her that she sounds as though she is enjoying life. Although harsh with herself, Mia is emotionally honest. "Had I been clinging to an idea of wretchedness while I was secretly enjoying myself?" she asks.<sup>108</sup> In her question, cultural contempt for self-pity meets the rawest of human emotions. Acknowledging enjoyment means relinquishing one's role as a wronged person and "moving on," knowing that the injustice one has suffered will probably never be made right. Mia is willing to embrace this view, but for others who have been hurt, the observation that one is enjoying oneself may come as a knowing jeer. It can feel like a taunt saying that unfairness will be forgotten, and no one cares about one's pain. Mia's use of the pejorative "clinging" makes it clear she refuses to prolong wretchedness. Hustvedt's novel depicts women as active, complex beings, but Mia shares American Standard's contempt for "clinging." This metaphor of grasping, which has been turned toxic through culture, seems grounded in bodily movements.

104. *Ibid.*, p. 59. In Bunyan's religious allegory, *The Pilgrim's Progress* (1678), the Slough of Despond represents a bog that hinders the protagonist on his way to salvation.

105. George Lakoff and Mark Johnson identify "up" and "down" as orientational metaphors often used to represent an emotional state; see Lakoff and Johnson, *Metaphors We Live By* (above, n. 18), p. 15.

106. *Ibid.*, pp. 10–11.

107. *Ibid.*, p. 50.

108. *Ibid.*, p. 51.

Whereas Mia experiences sorrow and self-pity as enmiring, her rage manifests itself through motion. Her anger inspires dramatic, creative, and hilarious revenge fantasies. At first, she imagines a "Monster Woman [who] blasts into space and bursts into bits that scatter and settle over the little town of Bonden."<sup>109</sup> As she rises out of her box over the summer, her rage fantasies increasingly involve others. Mia dreams of liberating Boris's lab rats: "Mia, the Fury of perpetual anger, releases all the tormented rats from their prisons and looks on with malicious glee as their milk-white bodies shoot across the floor."<sup>110</sup> She imagines herself returning from the dead to haunt Boris and the Pause in their Manhattan apartment. In her fantasy life, Mia flies out to others, even if it is to make them suffer for the pain they have caused her.

As Hustvedt's title suggests, relationships with other women help Mia heal. During her summer in Bonden, learning from women at the beginnings and ends of their lives gives her a broader perspective on her situation. Mia responds most strongly to her mother, who may be looking down in Hustvedt's third sketch. Like Mia, her mother has prioritized other people's needs over her own and now has mixed feelings about it. Having spent her life serving Mia, Mia's sister, and their father, she has no interest in remarrying, since she does not "want to take care of a man again."<sup>111</sup> Instead, she dedicates herself to her friends, women aged 84–102 whom Mia calls the "Five Swans."<sup>112</sup>

Among these aging women, Abigail stands out as most ferociously alive. A former art teacher bent ninety degrees from osteoporosis, Abigail reveals her "private amusements" to Mia.<sup>113</sup> Throughout her life, she has stitched out her frustration in subversive, hidden, embroidered scenes. Under a flap in a blanket, she has sewn a woman sucking up a town in her vacuum cleaner; inside a Christmas table runner, she has depicted five women masturbating. In a tragically ironic statement, Abigail tells her book club that "stepping on one's desires is deforming."<sup>114</sup> In Mia she senses a kindred spirit and entrusts her with the "amusements," plus a secret she has concealed all her life. Her greatest love was a woman, seventy years ago. Watching

109. *Ibid.*, p. 15.

110. *Ibid.*, p. 47.

111. *Ibid.*, p. 61.

112. *Ibid.*, p. 8.

113. *Ibid.*, p. 35.

114. *Ibid.*, p. 149.



the swans slip away and taking responsibility for Abigail's art inspire Mia to live differently in her remaining years.

Emotionally, Mia develops most intensely by teaching poetry to thirteen-year-old girls.<sup>115</sup> Led by a sociopathic teenager, her students torment Alice, who is "kinda different," and their sadism sparks painful memories of the bullying Mia once suffered.<sup>116</sup> Recalling hateful messages like the "voices" she once heard, Mia reflects, "I, wimp and crybaby, allowed them to taint me."<sup>117</sup> Rather than blaming her abusers, Mia blames herself for being abused, but she has ceased to believe that she is worthless. Her assignments to her class suggest her evolving emotional state. She asks them to write "secret me" poems, nonsense poems, and poems where you "really look at something."<sup>118</sup> She intervenes in their abuse of Alice by making them tell the story of the bullying from each other's points of view.

In narrating her own story, Mia attributes injustice less to individuals than to systems. Looking at the Swans, she thinks that they "may all have been born in the Land of Opportunity, but that opportunity had been heavily dependent on the character of their private parts."<sup>119</sup> Despite her fantasies of tormenting Boris, she depicts her neuroscientist husband as a round character whom the reader may begin to like. Mia points out that he is "scrupulously honest."<sup>120</sup> It has not occurred to him simply to have an affair, stay married, and not tell Mia about it. The renowned scientist who studies "the neural correlates of consciousness" has failed to master the washing machine's foibles.<sup>121</sup> Boris leaves his dirty clothes on the floor, and after several weeks of co-habitation, the Pause throws him out. Mia feels no glee on learning of his eviction and does not seem to want revenge. As Boris makes clumsy, earnest overtures, she wishes that he had left the Pause, since she cannot continue their relationship on its old terms. She can accept only a partnership that permits autonomy and growth, a bond that will let both husband and wife

115. Bein argues that as Mia teaches girls to create meaning through writing, she learns along with her students. As Mia tells her story, she "finds increasing pleasure in narrative agency" (Bein, "Present Women" [above, n. 89], p. 15).

116. Hustvedt, *The Summer without Men* (above, n. 90), p. 90.

117. *Ibid.*, p. 130.

118. *Ibid.*, pp. 49, 90.

119. *Ibid.*, p. 150.

120. *Ibid.*, p. 140.

121. *Ibid.*, p. 24.

“make meaning.”<sup>122</sup> When Boris asks Mia what he can do, she commands him, “Woo me.”<sup>123</sup> The novel’s final words indicate that if Boris wants her back, he will have to accept her as an equal. “Let him come to me,” Mia tells Daisy.<sup>124</sup> Mia’s container has shattered, and her emotions and identity will assume ever-more intricate new forms.

In ways that George Lakoff and Zoltán Kövecses have analyzed, Hustvedt describes emotion through spatial metaphors.<sup>125</sup> Mia first feels as if her brain has burst, and she is confined in a ward so that her pieces do not scatter. Hustvedt’s drawings depict a woman learning to climb from a box, but it would be wrong to think of this box as a body, a universal emotional container. Hustvedt’s novel suggests that like Barrett’s core affect, human identity is ever changing. It may adopt the forms of many boxes, but it persists in spite of them, not because of them.

### Whose Language, Whose Physiology?

The three creators of these fictional women represent their characters’ emotions through related metaphorical families. The first predominant group of metaphors draw their affinity directly from hindered or arrested motion. According to the logic of these metaphors, the rage, spite, and self-pity that often come with rejection hinder linear progress. These emotions may freeze movement altogether or cause a rejected character to move in circles. A second family of metaphors associates these painful emotions with darkness. The occlusion of daylight suggests a rejection of life in a person who has found life too painful. The “shattering” metaphors crafted by Hustvedt form a third, distinct group. In this case, an abandoned female character offers the figure, which is rooted in her experience. Unlike the first two groups of metaphors, Hustvedt’s “shattering” conveys the ways that human relationships transform as well as connect human selves. In their relation to motion, however, all three families of metaphors share an affinity. They represent emotions associated with rejection as restrictions of ongoing life.

Like the word “emotion,” these metaphors have roots in physiological experience. To function well, most human bodies need ex-

122. Bein, “Present Women” (above, n. 89), p. 18.

123. Hustvedt, *The Summer without Men* (above, n. 90), p. 144.

124. *Ibid.*, p. 182.

125. Lakoff and Johnson, *Metaphors We Live By* (above, n. 18); Kövecses, *Metaphor and Emotion* (above, n. 21), p. 21.

ercise and sunlight. Although bodies vary, long-term deprivation of light and movement will make most people miserable. In their studies of metaphors, George Lakoff and Mark Johnson have noticed a pattern indicating that “health and life are up; sickness and death are down.”<sup>126</sup> To some extent, the metaphors examined here represent mental sickness as bodily illness. These works depict characters who have experienced devastating psychological pain and are behaving as though they were physically ill. Recent research in neuroscience indicates that the relationship between mental and physical pain has its roots in shared cerebral structures.<sup>127</sup> But from culture to culture, from person to person, even in the three works analyzed here, the representation of painful emotions varies. Kövecses’s cross-cultural studies of emotion metaphors and Barrett’s conceptual act model account for these variations and their corporeal grounding. Metaphors for unpleasant emotions focus on restricted movement—but they offer a rich tapestry in the kinds of movements they depict.

Culture and politics enter metaphors for painful emotions through shades of difference in the metaphorical vehicle. Whose motion is being blocked? Who or what is obstructing it? How should the motion of life be represented? The choice to figure life through linear, progressive motion is a Western one, and it is often used to depict capitalism and colonialism in a favorable light. Corporate calls to “move forward” are always political, because they involve questions of perspective. What one person experiences as forward motion may mean the steam-rolling of another person’s life. Depictions of emotions involve politics because crafting metaphors to describe other people’s emotions colonizes those people’s experience.

This essay has focused on the emotions of rejected women, but as Kipling’s tale suggests, the outrage, bewilderment, and pain of the unwanted appear in a much wider range of people. Repressed rage, grudges, self-pity, and spite may arise in unwanted children, dismissed employees, or people living in an occupied country. Descriptions of the rejected as refusing to “let go” and “move on” represent the viewpoint of the rejecter, not the rejected. If Barrett is correct and language shapes the categories with which people experience emotions, then these metaphors can function hegemonically—as they may be intended. Tears and angry accusations embarrass the powerful, who want to inculcate cheerful acceptance of their social order. Shaping people’s emotions through metaphor is an effective tactic, since not only do rejected people often lack the vocabulary to

126. Lakoff and Johnson, *Metaphors We Live By* (above, n. 18), p. 15.

127. Frazzetto, *How We Feel* (above, n. 8), pp. 117–119.

---

protest; they may try to suppress emotions they are told not to feel. Supposedly, self-pity, spite, and hate benefit no one, least of all the people who feel them. But people whose bodies, minds, and souls are unwanted may have only their emotions to assert their humanity and protest the abuses committed against them. In crafting any emotion metaphor, one needs to hesitate, since its resonance may be strong. To represent emotion is to mold emotion as a personal and political force.