Linguistic Anthropology

256 Journal of Linguistic Anthropology

et al. in part III only draw minimally on the theoretical frameworks presented by García in parts I and II. The authors appear to use the theoretical frameworks to place programs around the world in specific silos; a useful but limited exercise. An approach highlighting four or five detailed localized case studies and using them to draw in the other examples may more usefully explore the realities of language in education practices. García's foundational discussions in parts I and II could be fruitfully complemented by relevant studies in linguistic anthropology or related fields. Finally, though perhaps not of prime interest to linguistic anthropologists, the critically important topic of assessment in multilingual education receives very short shrift.

Ín sum, despite the above critiques of García's rhetorical strategies and her formulation and application of theoretical frameworks, her book succeeds as a valuable attempt to show how theories, policies and practices are interconnected. Aside from the conceptual issues highlighted above, the detailed discussions of multilingual education policy alone make the book worth buying for scholars of language in education issues.

School of Education University of Michigan 610 E. University Avenue Ann Arbor, MI 48104 ababson@umich.edu

Lessons from a Quechua strongwoman: Ideophony, Dialogue and Perspective. *Janis B. Nuckolls*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2010. xvii + 229pp.

SIMEON FLOYD

Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics, Nijmegen

With her newest book, Janis Nuckolls revisits her earlier work covering a range of fascinating linguistic anthropological aspects of the oral discourse of speakers of the Pastaza variety of Ecuadorian Quechua, including ideophony, evidentiality and performative aspects of language, and expands and connects these topics in new ways. Her goal in this work is to link language use to themes of humanity in the ecological world of the Amazon rainforest, contributing to the literature on "perspectivism" by highlighting "meaningful, communicative interactions between humans and non-humans" (p. 1). Nuckolls uses the narratives of her primary research consultant Luisa Cadena as a lens for viewing broader cultural issues, an ethnographic strategy that has been used by a number of anthropologists working in lowland Ecuador and other areas of Amazonia (e.g. The Life and Times of Grandfather Alonso: Culture and History in the Upper Amazon, Blanca Muratorio, Rutgers University Press, 1995). Through Luisa, Nuckolls introduces us to the Pastaza Quechua social category of the sindzhi warmi (strong woman), a term applied to women known for their self-determination and resilience. Analyzing a series of narratives of Luisa's life experiences and her reflections on nature and morality, Nuckolls orients her discussion around the three themes mentioned in the book's title: ideophony, dialogue and perspective. While each of these topics yields new insights for the study of language and culture, I found some parts of the argument to cohere more than others. I will treat each of these three topics in turn.

With the first topic, ideophony, Nuckolls is clearly in her element, building on her substantial previous work on the subject, including her groundbreaking book *Sounds like Life: Symbolic Grammar, Performance, and Cognition in Pastaza Quechua* (Oxford University Press, 1996), which is still the most extensive linguistic anthropological treatment of ideophony to date. I first read this book while staying in a Pastaza Quechua-speaking community, and I remember trying out the vividly-described ideophones in my own speech to wonderful effect; the sensorial and emotive immediacy of the ideophones resulted in amazement, amusement and engagement on the part of my interlocutors, demostrating the insights of Nuckolls' analysis. Now she uses ideophony as a way to explore relationships between humans and other beings, showing how the linguistics of ideophones (grammatical animacy hierarchies, verb aspect, prosody, etc.) provide important resources that Quechua-speakers use in order to align with their environment. She also points out how ideophones are de-valued in institutional and political discourse, and as such might be considered endangered both in cultural and linguistic terms. The

Book Reviews 257

vivid examples of rodents running "tsupu tsupu," freshwater dolphins emerging "here bhuuuu there bhuuuu" and trees creaking "gyaung" (pp. 34-42) provide beautiful illustrations of the different analytical points.

The next topic that Nuckolls addresses is what she calls "ecological dialogism," adapting ideas from Bahktin to give an account of grammatical features of Quechua that have usually been described in terms of "evidentiality." She argues against an account of Quechua evidentials based on individual responsibility for information source. Instead she offers a "dialogic" approach that reframes the contrast of "first-hand experience versus hearsay" as "selfperspective versus other-perspective," showing how Luisa shifts between these two perspectives throughout her narratives. This account is interesting, but it does not quite achieve the intervention that it proposes, to "redefine evidentiality for at least one dialect of Quechua as marking speaker perspective rather than source of information" (p. 54). While accounts of the Quechuan evidential affixes (-mi, -shi, -cha, etc.) have considered information source to be important, they have also shown elements like epistemics and information sturcture to be part of their meaning in usage (Semantics and Pragmatics of Evidentials in Cuzco Quechua, Martina Faller, PhD Thesis, Stanford, 2002; The Structure of Wanka Quechua Evidential Categories, Rick Floyd, SIL, 1999; etc.). Additionally, since these morphemes have undergone semantic changes in the different Quechua varieties, it is problematic to counter an analysis of one variety with data from another. In Ecuadorian Highland Quechua the "evidential" set of affixes have historically been re-structured as compared to southern varieties and re-analyzed to mark different epistemic values. From the Pastaza Quechua examples presented here it is unclear whether identifying a similar process would help to clarify differences from the Peruvian varieties analyzed in the literature, or if Nuckolls' conclusion that "the evidential system is governed by a perspectival logic" (p. 54) is entirely warranted or necessary to account for the

Part of the problem in evaluating Nuckolls' grammatical argument is the book's unwieldy transcription system, which, aside from a few fully-glossed examples, shows only the English translation in the body text, with the corresponding monolingual, unglossed Quechua text in an appendix – I am not sure why the indigenous language is sent to the back seat while English gets to ride in front. A few readers may be able to simply read the Quechua text, but most will need to constantly jump back and forth between sections of the book in a distracting way. In addition, some of the more conversational and interactive exchanges in the texts are edited out of the English translation, which seems unproductive for examining the highly context-dependant nature of the grammatical phenomena under discussion. An account of Quechua evidentials based on perspective shifts seems promising, but it is hard to determine its value here because the case is not made very clearly.

After the chapters on ideophones and evidentiality, the remaining chapters directly address Pastaza Quechua-speakers' stances toward "nonhuman nature" based on a series of extended narratives. Nuckolls is in dialogue with an approach known as "perspectivism" that has gained much currency in Amazonian ethnography in recent years, originating with Viveiros de Castro's observations that many Amazonian cultures regard animals as sharing human sociality as seen from within the animals' perspective, while from the same vantage point humans appear animal-like ("Cosmological Deixis and Amerindian Perspectivism," *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 1999, 4(3): 469–488). The current trendiness of perspectivism seems to have pushed it beyond its original scope, and has resulted in attempts to squeeze many diverse people into an "Amazonian culture" box without much accountability to evidence.

The important contribution of Nuckolls' version of perspectivism is that it is indeed accountable to real instances of expressive language usage, where linguistic resources like ideophones and evidential morphologhy can be directly observed playing a role in cultural practices of perspective shifting. Luisa's narratives offer compelling examples of attitudes toward the environment that attribute human-like qualities to animals in culturally meaningful ways. In one example Luisa makes analogies between animal behaviors and human morality, explaining how one species of tortoise (*tsatawa*) embodies unfavorable traits because it scatters its eggs and does not care for them (*shungu ilyak man*, "it is a heartless one," p. 82, p. 158) while another species of turtle (*charapa*) carefully keeps her eggs in a nest, and is described as a good model for motherly behavior. In another example Luisa tells how she explored the boundaries between humans and animals by attempting to tame an anaconda; Nuckolls points out that although often considered by Amazonian ethnography to be distant from humans on a scale of sociality, Luisa found that the anaconda was more human-like than expected (*ña runa shina mak ara, wasita kwirak ara*, "He was like a person, the way he would care for our house," p. 116, p. 177). In the final two extended narratives, Nuckolls juxtaposes a story of how Luisa's family

members fended off a jaguar attack with another story of how Luisa fended off a wealthy non-indigenous landowner in a land dispute, finding parallels between their human and animal forms of predatoriness. Foregrounding these and many other compelling examples of Luisa's expressive linguistic forms demonstrates, in my opinion, a more well-grounded kind of perspectivism than is has sometimes been found in other more speculative studies in this framework.

Lessons from a Quechua strongwoman succeeds in opening new ethnographic spaces for the study of indigenous Amazonian perspectival orientations by bringing aspects of performance, narrative discourse, sound symbolism and "evidential" stances into now-classic debates about the position of humanity in the natural world. The book should be of interest to social anthropologists working with these issues not just in Amazonia but in any region, and is a good illustration of what the tools of linguistic anthropology can bring to the table. As a contribution to Quechuanist linguistics, particularly in the area of evidentiality and related phenomena, the book offers some provocative suggestions but does not a fully develop a linguistic argument in dialogue with the existing literature. I hope that Nuckolls will further develop her argument in future work, as there are still many questions to be addressed in the study of Quechua evidentials. Finally, while the methodology of centering an ethnographic study on a single individual can be a gamble, sacrificing much generalizability in exchange for focus and detail, the strong voice of Luisa Cadena transforms her into a virtual coauthor along with Nuckolls and makes for an engaging read, showing some ways in which this gamble has paid off.

Language and Cognition Group Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics Wundtlaan 1 6525XD Nijmegen The Netherlands simeon.floyd@mpi.nl

Essential Readings in Biosemiotics: Anthology and Commentary. *Donald Favareau* (ed.). Dordrecht, Heidelberg, London, New York: Springer. v + 880 pp.

JOSHUA RENO Goldsmiths College, University of London

Essential Readings in Biosemiotics (hereafter "ERB") is the third of five volumes released by Springer in 2010 as part of the "Biosemiotics" series edited by biologists Marcello Barbieri and Jesper Hoffmeyer. In his chapter, philosopher Günther Witzany offers a concise definition of the emerging interdiscipline: "Biosemiotics investigates life processes, and more concretely, sign use within and between organisms. Biosemiotics holds that no life processes could be coordinated and organized without signs" (p.735). The purpose of this anthology is avowedly genealogical. Editor Donald Favareau selects from a wide variety of intellectual figures, texts and tools to establish a common ancestry for biosemiotics and to emplot its future development.

From the start, this genealogical enterprise is entangled with the life of Thomas Sebeok. Biosemiotic founder and proselytizer, Sebeok was committed to fostering exchange between the humanities and sciences and across the Iron Curtain—even going so far as smuggling one of Juri Lotman's manuscripts out of Estonia to secure its publication (p. 193). The first two parts of ERB—"Sebeok's Precursors and Influences" and "The Biosemiotic Project of Thomas A. Sebeok"—include passages from Peirce and Jakob von Uexküll as well as Sebeok's principal collaborators and interlocutors. The last two include contemporary biosemioticians as well as independent scholars now recognized as intellectual forbearers (e.g., Gregory Bateson). If the figure of Sebeok represents scholars from the humanities searching for common ground with natural scientists, the field of biosemiotics has more recently been shaped by biologists, especially Hoffmeyer and Barbieri, deploying terminology from the humanities. Favareau traces these developments in his opening essay and insightful introductions to each chapter and scholar, detailing how their work descends from Sebeok's interdisciplinary project.

ERB is meant as a foundational text for those interested in synthesizing insights from biology, anthropology, philosophy and linguistics in order to counter forms of Cartesian